Status Report: W&M Task Force on Race and Race Relations (TFR3)

August 1, 2020

51 recommendations from W&M's 2016 TFR3 are itemized below, with actions and dates. For easy consultation, the status of each recommendation is coded with the following color key:

- Completed. May be a one-time action or sustained activity, with start date (41)
- Mixed success / target not yet met / decision not to pursue (10)

TFRR Recommendations	Response / Dates
1. The adoption of "leadership practices for diversity" (Aguire & Martinez 2007). Leadership practices for diversity seek to transform the university through diversity and inclusion efforts that include restructuring, infusion of new resources, re-allocating existing resources, and identifying measurable goals. Institutional leadership should regularly communicate that diversity and inclusion are central to the university's academic mission, goals and strategic priorities by establishing tangible goals and objectives, and measurable criteria to assess progress toward those goals.	● *Restructuring* : 2018 CDO as member of President Rowe's senior team; in process of creating five person D&I Council for CDO, in each school ● *Infusion of new resources* : 2018 3X annual budget under President Rowe, 122% growth in Financial Aid since 2013; 2020 restructuring of Pell packages. 2020 OTOD focus; $1M for Lemon/Highland; $30+M raised for diversity and equity initiatives across the university; ● *Re-allocating existing resources* : 2020 FTE identified in schools for D&I Council ● *Measurable goals* : 2019 Dashboard v1 created and presented to the board; annual updates in November, when institutional data is updated
2. The determination of the following:	
a. The extent to which the current Diversity Action Plans for each school were approved and acted upon.	2019 self-assessment led by deans in each school with reviews by external teams
b. Number of minority faculty participating in the research mission of the university.	Completed March, 2018 with Faculty of Color Survey
c. The number of minority faculty involved in governance at the university and department levels. Are they on committees that impact priorities, strategic visioning, structure and policy?	Completed March, 2018 with Faculty of Color Survey
d. The number of faculty who teach classes that focus on diversity issues in the curriculum. What are the classes? Are they electives? Are they built into curriculum requirements?	Completed March, 2018 with Faculty of Color Survey
3. The review of all official documentation (print and electronic materials) related to diversity to ensure that the documents read diversity and inclusion.	Completed in 2017-18 by the TFRR
4. Mandatory diversity training for administration, faculty, and staff.	Recommended in April, 2018 final TFRR report, but has not been implemented. Anti-racist and anti-bias training 2020. Diversity, Inclusion and Belonging training implemented for new and current employees, January 2022

5. Be proactive in creating an inclusive community by developing a curricular and research platform by which to mandate a race, ethnicity, sexuality, and inclusivity COLL requirement for sophomore students.	**Completed in April 2018 through TFRR Implementation team and Arts and Sciences. Originally called COLL 199 and changed to Coll**
a. Establish a university center for race, ethnicity, sexuality, and inclusivity, which would be composed of faculty fellows, appointed from existing faculty as well as 10 newly hired TE faculty, who will share the responsibility of teaching the proposed COLL requirement.	**Decision made in 2015 that $35M target should be deferred to the next campaign.** **COLL requirement distributed across departments, in the meanwhile, via reallocation of teaching loads, as the sustainable solution and one that shares broadly responsibility for inclusive teaching among many faculty. That broad responsibility is essential to ensure that under-represented faculty do not carry a disproportionate load (as is usually the case in higher ed.).**
b. The creation of this center could also serve to further strengthen existing relevant programs such as Africana Studies, Asian & Middle Eastern Studies, Hispanic Studies, Latin American Studies, Gender, Sexuality, and Women's Studies as well as those in nascent stages such as Native Studies and Asian & Pacific Islander American Studies.	**See above. Note progress in growing Native Studies and Asian & Pacific Islander American Studies.**
c. Further, the programs should be granted the capacity to hire and grant tenure to their own faculty to support efforts in faculty recruitment and retention.	**This is a resource-allocation recommendation that should be addressed structurally in A&S. There is a larger question around this about how to sustain interdisciplinary programs in A&S in a robust way, given how many there are.**
6. The creation of internal professional development opportunities through the Charles Center or Dean's Office.	**In 2017-18, the Dean of Arts & Sciences provided stipends for faculty to attend conferences based upon request. In January 2019 W&M became an institutional member of the National Center for Faculty Development and Diversity which offers each faculty member and graduate student free access to all webinars and opportunities for mentorship. ($20K university membership fee annually, plus $3-4K per faculty member per program.)**
7. The implementation of annual interviews of diverse faculty by relevant administrative leadership and the leadership of the individual units to learn about needs, challenges, and feasible/implementable solutions to identified barriers to success.	**Leadership interviews with incoming president (2018), provost (2019) and in prospect for deans (2020)** **Annual interviews at the program level – unclear whether consistent.**

8. The provision of external professional development opportunities that advance faculty careers such as the availability of professional development funds to network specifically at conferences with large numbers of diverse populations (e.g., National Council of Black Studies or other similar organizations) or to pay for leadership/administrative seminars, workshops, etc. that help facilitate pathways to senior administrative positions.	**In January 2019 W&M became an institutional member of the National Center for Faculty Development and Diversity which offers each faculty member and graduate student free access to all webinars and opportunities for mentorship. (covered by faculty research fund) by discipline.**
9. The creation of an addendum to the hiring process that requires applicants for faculty positions to submit a statement on diversity as part of their application packet, much in the same manner as their statement on teaching pedagogy.	• **In 2017-18, the TFRR worked with HR to provide an optional addendum on the W&M application that faculty can use if they want to require a diversity statement or philosophy when applying for a position.** • **2020, a required part of the baseline hiring protocols for all schools.**
10. W&M leadership should prioritize the proactive search for diverse faculty and senior administrators in an ongoing manner, not just when opportunities for individual searches arise.	• **FY17-FY20: W&M increased its faculty of color by 34% during the last four fiscal years. Scholars of color, now 16% of W&M's faculty compared to the median of 18% in VA public universities and 22% for U.S. News & World Report top 100 universities. We recognize we have farther to go and remain committed to sustained improvement.** • **FY19 and FY20: W&M more than doubled the persons of color in management occupations, which included more than doubling African Americans in these roles. Persons of color, now 10% at W&M (up from 4% in FY18), continue to be underrepresented in management roles and the university remains committed to sustained improvement efforts. The median is 12% for Virginia public universities and 15% for U.S. News & World Report top 100 universities.** • **2020 Faculty Hiring Plan implemented. CHRO recommendation to in-source recruitment underway.**
11. To identify potential hires of faculty and senior administrators, campus units should routinely invite women and persons of color to campus to give scholarly presentations.	**This is frequent but not mandated.**
12. Create a Target of Opportunity and Excellence Hiring Program to increase faculty diversity.	**2016 Faculty Hiring Program initiated. 10 hires. 2018 Future Faculty program initiated. 1 hire, paused for COVID-19. 2019 - 3 year faculty hiring pilot, to include target of opportunity hiring program.**
13. The goal of the university should be to have a proportionate rate of diversity between student and faculty populations (and/or a demographic comparable to the state demographic).	Alternative: use peer institutions as benchmark. **W&M has increased its faculty of color by 34% during the last four fiscal years.** Scholars of color now comprise 16% of W&M's faculty compared to the median of 18% for Virginia publics and 22% for USNWR top 100. We recognize we have further to go and remain committed to sustained improvement efforts.

14. The university should establish a post-doctoral/visiting scholar program to create opportunities for people within these underrepresented groups. The university should strengthen diversity graduate student recruitment fellowships such as the one instituted in Arts & Sciences by increasing both the amount and number of fellowships available. The fellowships should cover all tuition and fees. Optimally, the entire cost of attendance through the completion of the degree should be covered.	• **The Office of Diversity & Inclusion initiated the Future Faculty program in 2018. 1 post-doc hired before COVID-19 paused the program.** • **Fall 2020: the president has asked PhD-granting programs (under the direction of the provost and deans) to consider reallocations that ensure the rising cohort of under-represented PhDs stays in the profession, despite the pandemic. She has asked the provost to review all graduate packages for equity, benchmarking against peer packages.** • **W&M spends more than $4M annually on graduate packages in A&S alone.**
15. Search Committees	
a. Search Committees should consider, before writing job ads, areas within a discipline that feature a higher proportion of women and persons of color, and include those areas in language for the job description. (i.e. in Economics, more persons of color work on labor issues, more women work on gender issues in disciplines in the social sciences/humanities).	**Spring 2020 launch of baseline Faculty Hiring plan, created by Provost, CDO and CHRO with Vice-Provost. Required of all schools, with the support of the Faculty Assembly. Three year pilot with annual refinement.**
b. There should be required diversity and inclusion training on unconscious bias for all Search Committee members.	**Required as of 2020 Faculty Hiring Plan.**
c. Institutional leadership should intervene in diversifying search committees when necessary and terminating searches that fail to produce diverse pools of candidates (especially in departments with a history of hiring non-diverse candidates).	**See above.**
16. Conduct a faculty climate survey every two years.	• **Employee Surveys 2015, 2018** • **Faculty Survey 2016, 2019** • **Student Climate Survey 2018, 2019**
17. Craft a campaign specifically designed to finance the diversity initiatives detailed in this report.	**In June 2020, the focus of One Tribe One Day was devoted to Diversity & Inclusion, yielding the largest funding ever in the history of OTOD. The giving day yielded over 5,000 donors and over 1 million dollars for D&I. Specific funds highlighted: Diversity & Inclusion, Center for Student Diversity, Lemon Project, and Memorial to the Enslaved.**

Campus Climate

18. Pay the Facilities Management staff a living wage.	**There is no institution-level agreement on "living wage" threshold at W&M. Alignment with Commonwealth compensation goals have been achieved but that doesn't align with what employees believe. 2020 CHRO compensation study in process. We pay at or around market value, as the market value changes. Salaries are based on total compensation.**

19. Set up a mechanism by which Facilities Management staff can take advantage of professional development opportunities without fear of reprisal.	**2020 systematically implemented by CHRO: professional development training and goals as part of every employee's expectations.**
20. Actively encourage all employees to take advantage of campus events/programs.	**2020 systematically implemented by CHRO: professional development training and goals as part of every employee's expectations.**
21. Set up a formal mechanism through which Facilities Management staff can lodge complaints without fear of retribution.	**In 2017-2018, a new position was created to serve as a liaison position between Facilities Management and HR.**
22. Set annual training for supervisors and workers in the following areas: supervision, leadership, and communication skills.	**In 2018-2019, all FM managers and supervisors participated in a semester-long training conducted by Director of Training.**
23. Communicate clear expectations regarding the responsibilities of essential personnel, e.g., under what circumstances they are expected to report to work, and what types of tasks they are expected to perform once on the job.	**In November 2017, an external study was conducted by Amediate, LLC which yield areas of improvement for Facilities Management. The Chief Facilities Officer enhanced communications and implemented more transparency and fairness regarding essential personnel policies. Policy created with HR.**
24. Create a new position of Vice-President of Diversity and Inclusion, as currently exists at many schools.	• **2017, the TFRR recommended the addition of a Deputy Chief Diversity Officer to the Office of Diversity & Inclusion. Additionally, a full-time Administrative Assistant was hired for the office.** • **2018 CDO established as a member of the president's executive leadership, Cabinet, and as a key leader of strategic initiatives.** • **2020 CDO appointed to all senior administrator 360 assessments. Leadership for inclusion established as a category for evaluation.** **President Rowe has determined not to create new VPs at present due to financial constraints the university faces. In 2002, she eliminated 1 VP position. Beyond financial concerns, she views the "single VP" structure as an imperfect D&I solution, and has instituted a team-based D&I Council of Assistant Deans, embedded in each school, as a more effective "whole-institution" approach to D&I. Those searches will be re-initiated by the new deans in AY21.**
25. Based on the information obtained from all of the resources used in this report (surveys, fora, email submissions) members of the campus community identify the need for intensive annual mandatory training on race and race relations at all levels of the university (Board of Visitors, Senior Administration, faculty, staff, and students).	• **2019 systematic "courageous conversations" led by CDO across the university. Also conducted by the Board of Visitors.** • **As a part of the Antiracist work beginning in fall 2020, senior level administrators and BOV members will be engaged in discussions of how to dismantle systemic structures of racism that persists at the university.**

26. Institutionalize a periodic campus climate survey of the entire community.	**HR conducted a university-wide climate survey in 2015 and 2018. In 2022 4 pulse surveys will be completed. In 2023 Great Colleges to Work For will be completed, university wide.**
27. Conduct a campus climate survey of UG and graduate/professional students in fall 2016.	**Student Affairs conducted a climate survey in 2018 and in late 2019 (results pending, COVID delay)**
28. An outside vendor must be hired to conduct focus groups with Facilities Management staff.	**Amediate, LLC conducted an external review of Facilities Management in November 2018 and produced a full report with recommendations –several have been implemented.**
29. Contract with an outside vendor to conduct focus groups with all levels of employees and students on the VIMS campus.	**Initiated in 2017; staff departures completed in 2019. An external evaluator was used to assess the underrepresented minority student experience at VIMS and some of the questions touched on climate at VIMS. Specifically, the NSF required VIMS to use an external evaluator to interview students and alumni of the Hall Bonner program as it was winding down. The results of that effort are discussed in the VIMS Diversity Report with verbatim responses of students to climate-related questions.**
30. Create a formal Diversity and Inclusion Committee that will use best practices to develop a university-wide plan that will inform, drive, and influence plans at the unit level.	**Committee will be advisory to the CDO and will begin its work in Fall 2020**
31. Require each unit to provide a diversity plan that is aligned with the university plan and clearly outlines measurable goals and a timeline.	**Each academic school completed its diversity action plan in 2018. Every department in Arts & Sciences has completed a department level D&I plan. W&M DEI plan will be submitted to the Commonwealth in September 2020. Inclusive Excellence Plan was submitted to the Commonwealth in February 2020.**
32. Clearly outline a proactive recruitment strategy to identify and recruit members from underrepresented populations for faculty and senior administrative staff roles.	• **FY19 and FY20: W&M more than doubled the persons of color in management occupations, which included more than doubling African Americans in these roles.** • **2020 Faculty Hiring Plan implemented. CHRO recommendation to in-source recruitment underway.** • **Note, however that persons of color, now 10% at W&M (up from 4% in FY18), continue to be underrepresented in these roles and the university remains committed to sustained improvement efforts. The median is 12% for Virginia public universities and 15% for U.S. News & World Report top 100 universities.**
33. Name important and prominent campus buildings to more fully reflect the diversity and achievement of the entire W&M community.	**Lemon Hall and Hardy Hall (2016), Mary Mumford Plaza (2019), all women's names updated on campus buildings (2019) Wren Plaques for 50th/100th Anniversaries (2018) Working Group created, with renaming principles as a deliverable August 2020**

34. Formally identify opportunities when diversity-related topics can be infused in the COLL curriculum (freshman seminar, COLL 300, etc.).	**In fall 2020 the new Post Bacc position in D&I will coordinate between the Center for Liberal Arts and CSD to create opportunities.**
35. Establish a formal cross-cultural mentorship program for faculty development around diversity-related issues.	**NCFDD membership 2018**

Prevention and Education

36. Adjust the new COLL curriculum to include a mandatory class on race and other intersecting identities.	**2016-2020 implementation.**
37. Integrate race and diversity awareness courses into the required COLL curriculum through the creation of a first-year COLL course focusing on race in American history and society for all undergraduate students.	**2016-2020 implementation.**
38. Regularly offer, seminar-style, one- or two-credit COLL 200 electives course(s) on current topics in race and identity in American society.	**Initiated in 2018. With emphasis on anti-racism, new topics will be offered as COLL 350 courses for 2020-21. CLA is coordinating this effort.**
39. We recommend that additional racial diversity and bias awareness education be required for all students in leadership roles, as well as for significant student communities such as fraternity and sorority chapters and athletes. This would also include all students in paraprofessional roles, such as peer educators, peer mentors, peer advisors, Residence Life staff, orientation aides, student employees, Honor and Conduct Council members, Student Assembly members, tutors, Writing Center assistants, tour guides, and other similar roles. This recommendation recognizes that these campus leaders among the student body population are often looked to as role models.	**Racial/Bias Awareness Training incomplete 2019 Consent campaign 2019 Courageous Conversations (university wide, Board of Visitors), stereotype threat workshops (faculty and administrators)**
40. Establish two graduate assistantships and/or fellowships in the Center for Student Diversity. These additions would enable and empower the CSD to offer more resources and oversight in student leadership training, establish and provide safe spaces on campus for students from racial and ethnic minority backgrounds, and help further engage social justice initiatives. A dedicated graduate assistantship/fellowship will ensure that the current offerings remain robust while allowing the development of new programs and additional resources to be made available to the student body.	**Center for Student Diversity received 1 new Graduate Assistant position in 2017-2018. Diversity & Inclusion Post-Bac program launched fall 2020, will work closely with the Center for Student Diversity.**

41. The College should create and fund a faculty development institute similar to VCU's Institute on Inclusive Teaching. Such an institute would develop training programs and promote best practices/informational documents focusing specifically on topics of teaching diverse student populations and maintaining respectful classroom environments for anyone providing instruction, including tenure-track faculty, non-tenure-eligible faculty, teaching fellows and assistants.	**2019 New Learning Studio, with a clear focus on D&I. CDO and STL Director collaborating on faculty workshops.**
42. Specific expectations for managers, directors, and department chairs should be established that relate to supervision, mentoring, communication, harassment and discrimination, and other inclusive workplace practices. The College must integrate diversity competencies into position descriptions and performance evaluations to ensure accountability and uniformity in expectations and process across all sectors of on-campus staffing.	• **2019 New CHRO hired with mandate to integrate competencies throughout the organization** • **2019-20 The Chief Human Resources Officer, Dr. Christopher Lee, and Chief of Staff, Dr. Jeremy Martin, offered multiple sessions on values-based leadership with the expectation that all supervisors at the university attend at least one. The sessions focused on fulfilling President Rowe's charge that supervisors begin team meetings by sharing one of William & Mary's values, equipping leaders with tools to engage values-driven conversations with their teams. Small group breakout conversations provided the opportunity for supervisors to practice these discussions. Additional follow up sessions are planned during the 2020-21 year to continue reinforcing the expectation of leading within William & Mary's values.** • **2020 The Executive Leadership Team and Cabinet are respectively modeling this behavior by beginning each meeting by sharing a university value and noting the expectation to one another that the habit be pervasive throughout every unit.** • **2020 - 2021 CHRO implemented monthly supervisor forum and manager forum.**
43. Expand the staff in the Center for Student Diversity.	**Completed in 2018**

Bias Reporting and Incident Protocol

44. Commit to implementing an Incident Information System at the College by the spring of 2018 that unites the university's various reporting channels under one overall reporting gateway.	**2016 https://www.wm.edu/report/index.php**
45. An Incident Assessment Team should be appointed to conduct initial reviews of all reports and determine what, if any, referrals should be made.	**2016 – those responsible specified in regulatory provisions in a variety of areas of compliance.**

46. Reporting to the Incident Assessment Team should not be anonymous. In order for the system to inspire mutual trust, the College must be able to follow up appropriately on reports received, which may require obtaining further information from the reporting party, referring more serious reports for formal investigation, facilitating restorative justice efforts, or providing support and care services to the reporting party. Such efforts are not possible with anonymous reports.	**2016 Report System and Guidance** **2018: restorative justice framework implemented in student conduct cases**
47. The College should affirm its commitment to the principles of respect and free speech.	**2016, 2018** **2020 pandemic right to protest**
48. The College should promote awareness of the Incident Information System by all members of the community.	**2016 Report System and Guidance**
49. The Incident Information Assessment Team should provide annual reports of its activity to the community.	**Phase I completed in 2018-2019. We received approval for an Employee Reporting module that is in the final stages of data coordination as of AY20. It will report discrimination, harassment and retaliation, workplace misconduct, and well-being concerns similar to the student system for care reports. Reports are triaged by OCE and HR to determine how to respond.**
50. The College should evaluate and reassess the Incident Information System and implement revisions annually.	**We received approval for an Employee Reporting module that is in the final stages of data coordination as of AY20. The system will intake reports of discrimination, harassment and retaliation, work place misconduct, and well-being concerns similar to the student system for care reports.** **Reports are triaged by OCE and HR to determine how to respond.**
51. The College should devote appropriate resources to support implementation and ongoing maintenance of any new Incident Information system.	**IT funding limitations (especially under COVID) slow all system upgrades at W&M. Major backlogs of deferred maintenance are being prioritized. Topics for the CIO to address.**